

TABLE OF CONTENTS

| | |
|-----------------------|------|
| Acknowledgements | vii |
| List of Abbreviations | xiii |

INTRODUCTION 1

| | | |
|---|---|---|
| 1 | The call for human rights impact assessments of trade agreements | 1 |
| 2 | The origins of human rights impact assessments in environmental and social assessment | 3 |
| 3 | <i>Ex ante</i> impact assessments of trade agreements | 7 |
| 4 | Research question and structure | 9 |

CHAPTER I

A HUMAN RIGHTS FRAMEWORK FOR IMPACT ASSESSMENT OF TRADE AGREEMENTS 13

| | | |
|-----|---|----|
| 1 | Introduction | 13 |
| 2 | Human rights: what rights, whose rights and whose obligations? | 13 |
| 2.1 | What human rights are subject of impact assessments of trade agreements? | 13 |
| 2.2 | Are market freedoms human rights? | 17 |
| 2.3 | Whose rights are subject of Human Rights Impact Assessments of trade agreements? | 19 |
| 2.4 | What actors are subject to Human Rights Impact Assessments of trade agreements? | 21 |
| 3 | A proposed framework for Human Rights Impact Assessments | 30 |
| 3.1 | A rights-based approach to impact assessment | 30 |
| 3.2 | Human rights should be the explicit subject of a HRIA | 30 |
| 3.3 | The process of the assessment should respect human rights | 34 |
| 3.4 | The impact assessment should contribute to building the capacity of rights-holders and duty-bearers | 36 |
| 3.5 | The impact assessment should involve human rights actors | 37 |
| 4 | Original aspects of the human rights framework | 39 |
| 4.1 | Two social impact assessment frameworks | 39 |

| | | |
|-----|---|----|
| 4.2 | Areas of overlap between human rights and social impact assessment frameworks | 40 |
| 4.3 | Original aspects of the Human Rights Impact Assessment framework | 43 |
| 5 | Conclusions | 49 |

CHAPTER II

A METHODOLOGY FOR HUMAN RIGHTS IMPACT ASSESSMENTS OF TRADE AGREEMENTS

| | | |
|------|---|-----|
| | | 51 |
| 1 | Introduction | 51 |
| 2 | Trade agreements subject to Human Rights Impact Assessments | 52 |
| 2.1 | The content of trade agreements | 52 |
| 2.2 | Sectors relevant to Human Rights Impact Assessments | 59 |
| 3 | Ten categories of impact of trade agreements on human rights | 61 |
| 3.1 | Trade law complements human rights law | 62 |
| 3.2 | Trade agreements promote the growth and resources necessary for the progressive realization of human rights | 65 |
| 3.3 | Trade agreements can breach human rights in practice | 66 |
| 3.4 | Trade agreements can limit government capacity to promote human rights | 69 |
| 3.5 | Trade agreements lead to a ‘race-to-the-bottom’ in human rights protection as countries try to compete on global markets | 72 |
| 3.6 | Trade agreements limit the use of trade measures to improve the enjoyment of human rights abroad | 74 |
| 3.7 | Trade law conflicts with human rights law | 77 |
| 3.8 | Enforcement of trade agreements is stronger than human rights enforcement which could lead to a prioritization of trade law over human rights law | 79 |
| 3.9 | Trade agreements and trade institutions fail to respect the right to take part in the conduct of public affairs | 83 |
| 3.10 | Trade ‘values’ threaten human rights ‘values’ | 84 |
| 4 | A step-by-step process | 86 |
| 4.1 | General process | 86 |
| 4.2 | Step one: Preparation | 89 |
| 4.3 | Step two: Screening | 92 |
| 4.4 | Step three: Scoping | 93 |
| 4.5 | Step four: Analysis | 98 |
| 4.6 | Step five: Recommendations | 99 |
| 4.7 | Step six: Monitoring and evaluation | 101 |
| 4.8 | Step seven: Preparation of the report | 102 |
| 5 | Data collection and analysis | 103 |
| 5.1 | Qualitative, quantitative and mixed-methods | 103 |

| | | |
|-----|--|-----|
| 5.2 | Human rights indicators | 106 |
| 5.3 | Techniques for collecting and analyzing data | 114 |
| 6 | Conclusion | 121 |

CHAPTER III

| | |
|--|-----|
| ASSESSMENT OF CAFTA: THE IMPACT OF INTELLECTUAL PROPERTY PROTECTION ON THE RIGHT TO HEALTH AND RELATED RIGHTS IN COSTA RICA | 123 |
|--|-----|

| | | |
|-----|--|-----|
| 1 | Introduction | 123 |
| 2 | Step one: Preparation | 125 |
| 3 | Step two: Screening | 129 |
| 4 | Step three: Scoping | 134 |
| 4.1 | Introduction | 134 |
| 4.2 | Intellectual property protection and access to medicines in CAFTA | 134 |
| 4.3 | Human rights and access to medicines in Costa Rica | 149 |
| 4.4 | Identification of potential impacts | 155 |
| 4.5 | Assessment techniques | 156 |
| 4.6 | Human rights indicators | 158 |
| 5 | Step four: Analysis | 162 |
| 5.1 | Introduction | 162 |
| 5.2 | Step one: Impacts of CAFTA on extending market exclusivity of IP protected pharmaceuticals | 162 |
| 5.3 | Step two: Impact of extended market exclusivity on prices | 167 |
| 5.4 | Step three: Impact on human rights | 171 |
| 5.5 | Indicators in light of the introduction of the TRIPS plus provisions | 183 |
| 6 | Step five: Conclusions and recommendations | 184 |
| 7 | Step six: Monitoring and evaluation | 186 |

CHAPTER IV

| | |
|--|-----|
| BENEFITS AND RISKS OF HUMAN RIGHTS IMPACT ASSESSMENTS OF TRADE AGREEMENTS | 187 |
|--|-----|

| | | |
|-----|---|-----|
| 1 | Introduction | 187 |
| 2 | Benefits of Human Rights Impact Assessments of trade agreements | 187 |
| 2.1 | A comprehensive framework | 187 |
| 2.2 | A more objective standard | 191 |
| 2.3 | A developed analytical framework | 192 |
| 2.4 | A limitation to 'trade-offs' | 196 |
| 2.5 | Legal accountability | 198 |
| 2.6 | A supportive network of actors | 200 |

Table of Contents

| | | |
|-----|---|------------|
| 2.7 | Conclusions | 201 |
| 3 | Risks of Human Rights Impact Assessments of trade agreements | 201 |
| 3.1 | Politicization | 201 |
| 3.2 | Annexation | 203 |
| 3.3 | Externalization | 205 |
| 3.4 | Imbalance | 205 |
| 3.5 | Feasibility | 206 |
| 3.6 | Conclusions | 209 |
| | FINAL OBSERVATIONS | 211 |
| | Annex 1. Intellectual Property Protection in the TRIPS Agreement relevant to access to medicines | 221 |
| | Annex 2. Intellectual Property Protection of Pharmaceuticals in Practice | 225 |
| | Samenvatting | 227 |
| | Bibliography | 231 |
| | Curriculum vitae | 247 |